

# **International Journal of Strategic Marketing Practice (IJSMP)**

**Advertising Excellence through Social Influence and Intrinsic Motivation Stages**

Jack A. Lesser, PhD and Michael Theisen



## Advertising Excellence through Social Influence and Intrinsic Motivation Stages



Jack A. Lesser, PhD

Assistant Professor of Marketing, College of Business and Management, Metropolitan State University



Michael Theisen

College of Business and Management, Metropolitan State University

### Article History

Received 5<sup>th</sup> October 2025

Received in Revised Form 16<sup>th</sup> November 2025

Accepted 8<sup>th</sup> December 2025



### How to cite in APA format:

Lesser, J., & Theisen, M. (2025). Advertising Excellence through Social Influence and Intrinsic Motivation Stages. *International Journal of Strategic Marketing Practice*, 7(1), 18–33. <https://doi.org/10.47604/ijjsmp.3582>

### Abstract

**Purpose:** This study examines advertising effectiveness within Integrated Marketing Communications (IMC) by integrating Kelman's social influence theory with Ryan and Deci's self-determination framework. The research addresses a theoretical gap by moving beyond stage-based models to explain the psychological processes underlying how and why consumers respond to advertising messages.

**Methodology:** Drawing upon ten years of systematic evaluation, this study identifies enduring qualities of advertising effectiveness observed across outstanding campaigns. Expert judges with academic and professional marketing expertise evaluate how well each advertising quality aligns with four integrated stages of social influence and intrinsic motivation. The analysis employs established criteria from both theoretical frameworks to assess the motivational depth and engagement of the qualities.

**Findings:** The results demonstrate that advertising excellence emerges from guiding consumers through progressive stages of motivational engagement rather than relying on isolated persuasive tactics. Compliance-oriented strategies (urgency, repetition) prove effective for immediate behavioral activation, but they have limited impact at deeper motivational levels. Qualities that reflect empowerment, self-belief, and meaningful reflection achieve the highest relationship with internalization and intrinsic regulation stages, and they provide sustained consumer engagement.

**Unique Contribution to Theory, Practice, and Policy:** This research contributes to marketing theory by synthesizing Kelman's social influence framework with Ryan and Deci's self-determination theory, offering a unified model for understanding advertising effectiveness across motivational stages. For practitioners, the findings provide strategic guidance for sequencing advertising messages to progress audiences from compliance to commitment. From a policy perspective, the integrated framework supports ethical advertising practices that foster genuine consumer engagement rather than manipulative persuasion tactics.

**Keywords:** Advertising, Effectiveness, Integrated Marketing Communications, Social Influence, Intrinsic Motivation, Self-Determination Theory, Consumer Psychology

**JEL Classification:** M31, M37, D91

©2025 by the Authors. This Article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>)

## INTRODUCTION

Marketing excellence often centers on the question: How can an effective advertisement be developed to enhance a brand's identity? Although advertising plays a critical role in marketing, marketing excellence considers far more than just the development of an advertisement. Moorman and Day (2016), for example, conceptualized the "4 C's" framework for organizing marketing excellence, which emphasizes capabilities, configuration (such as organizational structure), culture, and the capital required for effective marketing leadership. Similarly, Homberg et al. (2020) examined the managerial competencies that shape marketing excellence. This article, though, focuses on only one means to achieve marketing excellence: the development of effective advertising.

The importance of advertising effectiveness cannot be overstated. Global advertising expenditures are projected to exceed \$1.1 trillion in 2025 (WPP Media, 2025). In the United States, the Association of National Advertisers (ANA, 2024) reported that advertising contributes approximately \$7.1 trillion in sales activity and supports one in five American jobs. Together, these figures underscore advertising's central worldwide role.

Seminal industry leaders, such as David Ogilvy and Leo Burnett, have long emphasized the significance of impactful advertising. Ogilvy, the founder of Ogilvy and Mather Ad Agency, famously argued, "Ninety-nine percent of all advertising doesn't sell much of anything" (Ogilvy, 1983, p. 67). Similarly, Leo Burnett, founder of Leo Burnett Ad Agency, explained, "I am one who believes that one of the greatest dangers of advertising is not that of misleading people, but that of boring them to death" (Burnett, 1961, p. 34).

Therefore, what makes advertising effective and avoids the risk of boring consumers? Ogilvy argued, "It takes a big idea to attract the attention of consumers and get them to buy your product. Unless your advertising contains a big idea, it will pass like a ship in the night" (Ogilvy, 1983, p. 89). This article explores different "big ideas" in advertising and evaluates how they can be strategically implemented across various stages of the consumer decision-making process to maximize effectiveness.

In addition to considering the effectiveness of an advertisement, the integrated influence of an entire advertising campaign is relevant. IMC examines how advertising channels can be strategically coordinated to deliver effective communication. By integrating advertising efforts, IMC aims to unify brand messaging across channels that work together to guide consumers through the decision-making process, building awareness, and fostering interest in a brand (Kotler, Keller, & Chernev, 2022, p. 284). The most common approach to integrate IMC is through the "AIDA" (awareness, interest, desire, and action) model. AIDA's simplicity makes it invaluable for tailoring communications: awareness is used to get initial interest in an advertisement (Belch & Belch, 2021); interest involves increasing engagement with a message (Rawal, 2013); desire captures deeper involvement (Tristanto et al., 2021); and, action leads to a purchase (Kotler & Keller, 2016).

However, AIDA's strength lies in explaining what consumers do, rather than why and how they behave in such ways. Consumer loyalty, by contrast, is shaped by deeper psychological drivers, including emotions, motivations, and social influences (Heath, 2007; Zarantonello, Schmitt, & Jedidi, 2020). It also provides a deeper consumer connection than getting "action." Lasting post-purchase behaviors involve emotional forms of loyalty towards a brand, and even advocacy towards it (Oliver, 1999). Instead, this article uses theories from the social sciences

that have long been developed to determine how to integrate individuals' awareness, interest, and lasting behavior. They focus on the "how and why" of behavior, providing a deeper explanation for the mechanisms of effective advertising.

What, finally, are some "big ideas" for advertisements that can be used in the development of integrated marketing communications of a consumer's behavior? One of the authors of this article taught marketing students for decades. Each semester from 2015 through early 2025, he asked his students, as part of a capstone advertising project, to evaluate and improve a list of qualities that define effective advertisements. They selected and refined, year-to-year, the list of qualities based on their beliefs about why advertisements they viewed were exceptional. Students' considerations, presented in Table 1, represent their concluding beliefs over the decade. Although the research did not follow rigorous scientific methods, their conclusions demonstrate strong "conceptual face validity and ecological relevance (Baumeister et al., 2022)" compared to established studies on advertising effectiveness (e.g., Eisend & Farid, 2016; Nielsen, 2017; Rucker & Calkins, 2024).

In summary, this article attempts to develop an integrated basis for analyzing Integrated Marketing Communications (IMC) through the use of two widely recognized psychological theories. The research establishes measurement criteria for these seminal theories and uses expert judges to assess how various qualities of advertising excellence correspond to their distinct stages. Although exploratory, this study addresses critical questions, focusing on uncovering enduring qualities that define the "big ideas" essential for impactful advertisements. By examining these qualities through well-supported theoretical stages, it attempts to provide a deeper understanding of the "how and why" underlying consumer responses to advertising strategies.

### **Problem Statement**

Despite the substantial body of research on advertising effectiveness, a significant gap exists in understanding how specific advertising qualities relate to different stages of consumer psychological engagement. The widely used AIDA model describes behavioral stages but fails to explain the underlying psychological mechanisms that drive consumer responses. This limitation leaves practitioners without clear guidance for designing advertising campaigns that foster deep, lasting consumer connections rather than merely prompting immediate action.

The gap addressed by this study is threefold. First, existing frameworks lack integration between social influence theory and motivation theory in the advertising context. Second, there is limited empirical evidence connecting specific advertising qualities to distinct motivational stages. Third, practitioners need actionable guidance for sequencing advertising messages across consumer psychological development stages.

This study benefits multiple stakeholders. Marketing scholars gain a unified theoretical framework that bridges social influence and self-determination theories. Advertising practitioners receive evidence-based guidance for selecting and sequencing advertising qualities based on intended motivational outcomes. Marketing educators obtain a structured approach for teaching advertising strategy that goes beyond surface-level models. Finally, organizations benefit from more effective advertising investments that build sustainable consumer relationships rather than relying solely on short-term compliance tactics.

## **Qualities of Advertising Excellence from Student Evaluations for Over Ten Years**

1. Tell a compelling emotional story, and not just convey information.
2. Give the listener a "solution" to problems and concerns in life.
3. Use emotion in the ad's story.
4. A great ad shows a sense of urgency.
5. Provide "symbolic language" that captures the senses.
6. "Show," and not tell in the ad.
7. Good advertising is about how your product will change customers' worlds.
8. Determine why you are the best and "say it."
9. Make sure that your ad stands out from thousands and millions of others.
10. Your efforts should show a compelling Unique Selling Proposition.
11. You should "make the viewer think."
12. You should be relatable to the listener.
13. Good marketing is concerned with getting the listener to believe in him or herself.
14. Effective communication helps people realize that they can overcome in life.
15. A good message puts the listener in the shoes of the characters in the message.
16. Effective marketing offers realism.
17. An excellent message is remembered for a long time.
18. The ad calls the listener to action.
19. Great communication gets immediate attention and keeps it throughout the message.
20. Repeat the ad often enough so that the listener will be interested in the message.
21. Has a message that stands out from competitors' messages.
22. Has a "powerful idea" that stands out to consumers.

## **Theoretical Foundations**

As explained above, Integrated Marketing Communications (IMC) is one of the most widely used approaches in modern advertising, providing a strategic framework for delivering consistent and unified messaging and developing effective advertising campaigns. The classical AIDA model, awareness, interest, desire, and action, is often used in IMC to examine consumer behavior stages. AIDA's strength is in its simplicity. Yet, it does not build on theories of social influence or psychological motivation that provide more insight into "how" or "why" to develop excellent advertising efforts that underlie consumers' underlying motives. Kelman's (1958) Social Influence Theory and Ryan and Deci's (2017) Intrinsic Motivation Framework provide complementary perspectives that illuminate the "how" and "why" behind consumer behavior.

Kelman's theory focuses on three stages of behavioral change: Compliance, Identification, and Internalization. Compliance relies on external rewards or punishments, such as discounts or promotions, to drive immediate action (Kelman, 1958, pp. 53-56). Identification involves

relational or group affiliations, often achieved through celebrity endorsements or relatable campaigns (Kelman, 1958, pp. 56-58). Internalization reflects the deepest form of influence, where behaviors involve deeply held values and persist independently of external incentives (Kelman, 1974, pp. 126-127).

Ryan and Deci's (2000; 2017) framework complements Kelman's by focusing on the psychological processes that develop consumer motivation through extrinsic and intrinsic motivation. External Regulation mirrors Compliance, emphasizing behaviors driven by rewards or penalties (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pp. 72-73). Identified Regulation bridges external and internal motivations by associating behaviors with personally relevant goals (Ryan & Deci, 2000, p. 74). The goals may not be deep, innate aspects of an individual's overarching values and self-concept, but they are nonetheless important. For example, a person may identify with an advertisement that focuses on the nutrition of a product, not because it is necessarily a deep, endearing value, but because health emphasis is a relevant goal. Finally, Integrated Regulation reflects the matching of behavior with values and self-concept, and Intrinsic Regulation represents the most autonomous form of motivation, where behavior is performed for inherent satisfaction (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pp. 74-75).

Table 1 summarizes and compares the stages from both theoretical frameworks, providing integrated measurements that guide the expert evaluation process used in this study.

**Table 1: Kelman's and Deci and Ryan's Stages and Their Measurements**

Kelman's Stages	Basis and Measurement	Deci and Ryan's Stages	Basis and Measurement	Integrated Measurement	Comparison and Relationship
<b>Compliance</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Behavior change occurs when external rewards/punishments are present (Kelman, 1958, pp. 53-56).	<b>External Regulation</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Behavior caused by external contingencies, such as rewards or punishments (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pp. 72-73).	<b>Measurement:</b> Motivation that is externally controlled through rewards that cease once these external forces are no longer present.	Both describe externally controlled motivation, where behavior ceases when external forces are removed.
	<b>Measurement:</b> Temporary motivation to adhere to rules or norms		<b>Measurement:</b> Motivation based on external rewards or coercive factors to sustain behavior.		Compliance is equivalent to External Regulation because it is extrinsically motivated and lacks internalization.
<b>Identification</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Behavior connected to relational or group goals (Kelman, 1958, pp. 56-58).	<b>Identified Regulation</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Behavior involves personally relevant goals and values, even if not inherently	<b>Measurement:</b> Engagement in valued activities consciously endorsed for goal alignment but not yet	Both involve conscious adoption of behaviors perceived as personally relevant, fostering

			enjoyable (Ryan & Deci, 2000, p. 74). Not part of deeply integrated self-concept.	fully integrated into the individual's self-concept.	stability but lacking full integration into the self-concept.
	<b>Measurement:</b> Engagement in relationships, social groups, or brand affiliations through aspirational or relatable connections that foster relevant goals.		<b>Measurement:</b> Engagement in valued activities consciously endorsed for goal alignment but not yet fully integrated into the individual's self-concept.		Identification and Identified Regulation emphasize a connection with relational or personal goals, creating a bridge from external to internal motivation.
<b>Internalization</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Behavior reflects deeply integrated values and persists without external incentives (Kelman, 1958, pp. 58–60).	<b>Integrated Regulation</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Behavior is fully connected to personal values and integrated into the self-concept (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pp. 74–75).	<b>Measurement:</b> Behavior that is strongly connected with the individual's self-concept and personal goals, emphasizing connection to deeply held values and intrinsic motivations.	Internalization and Integrated Regulation both describe behaviors driven by autonomous motivation and personal value alignment, ensuring persistence and autonomy.
	<b>Measurement:</b> Behavior that adheres to principles and deep internal values.		<b>Measurement:</b> Behavior that fully aligns with the individual's self-concept and personal goals, reflecting a harmonious connection between action and identity.		Integrated Regulation extends Kelman's Internalization by emphasizing the connection with the self-concept, thus offering a richer theoretical explanation.

<b>Internalization (Innately Intrinsic)</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Describes behaviors performed for a lasting and inherent satisfaction (when deeply internalized) (Kelman, 1958, pp. 58–60).	<b>Intrinsic Regulation</b>	<b>Basis:</b> Behavior performed purely for its endearing and inherent satisfaction or enjoyment (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pp. 71–72).	<b>Measurement:</b> Behavior that represents an endearing self-determined connection that emphasizes competence, relatedness, and integration with deeply held values, arising directly from engagement with the activity.	Kelman's Internalization focuses on the long-term stability of behaviors aligned with deeply held core values, emphasizing enduring commitment. In contrast, Ryan and Deci's Intrinsic Regulation focusses on the immediate psychological experience of intrinsic motivation, driven by feelings of competence, relatedness, and self-determination.
	<b>Measurement:</b> Behavior that represents a deep and lasting adherence to principles and values that connect to intrinsically, driving behavior independently of external rewards and sustained by personal conviction.		<b>Measurement:</b> Behavior that represents an enduring self-determined connection characterized by perceptions of competence, relatedness, and fulfillment derived from the activity itself.		Intrinsic Regulation complements Kelman's Internalization by representing behaviors that are both deeply connected with core values and inherently fulfilling, illustrating the convergence of enduring value-driven commitment and immediate psychological satisfaction.

## Application to Advertising Stages

### Compliance and External Regulation

Compliance and External Regulation focus on externally motivated behaviors driven by rewards or punishments. IMC tools, such as promotional advertising or limited-time offers, are examples of this stage. For example, the message, "buy now before it's gone," captures attention and drives immediate action. As shown in column five of Table 2, about their integrated motivation, these strategies are measured by their reliance on external "motivation that is externally controlled through rewards that cease once these external forces are no longer present."

### Identification and Identified Regulation

Both Identification and Identified Regulation focus on emotional relevance and connection to personal or group goals. These stages may develop aspirational branding or relatable messaging to foster personal or group goals. For example, an advertisement for a restaurant may attempt to promote a healthy breakfast because its targeted individual seeks one. The measurement of either Identification or Identified Regulation, in column five, involves "engagement in valued activities consciously endorsed for goal alignment but not yet fully integrated into the individual's self-concept." As many realize who seek healthy diets, more may be involved in having an enjoyable meal rather than the food's health aspects. In other words, Identification and Identified Regulation may be achieved, and direct consumer goals may be aligned, through the communication of the healthiness of a breakfast. Yet, the consumer may not have a complete and lasting enthusiasm to eat at the restaurant.

### Internalization and Integrated Regulation

Internalization and Integrated Regulation both represent a strong connection between a consumer's personal values and self-concept. In 2017, Apple developed a "Think Different" campaign that showed Campaigns such as Apple's "Here's to the Crazy Ones" ad, that attempted to transcend transactional messaging and evoke a sense of purpose and identity (see, for example, Apple, 1997) by showing well-known individuals from the past who stressed their individuality. The "integrated measure" for Internalization and Integrated Regulation here is: "Behavior that is strongly connected with the individual's self-concept and personal goals, emphasizing connection to deeply held values and intrinsic motivations." An individual who strongly identifies with an overarching desire for individualism may interpret the ad as meeting Internalization and Integrated Regulation.

### Internalization (Innately Intrinsic) and Intrinsic Regulation

Internalization (Innately Intrinsic) and Intrinsic Regulation describe enduring behaviors driven by deeply held values and intrinsic satisfaction. As suggested by column five's integrated measurement in Table 2, the stages are different from the earlier stages because they involve even more endearing and lasting connections with an individual's identity. They may be more "ideal points" than types of advertising strategies that are commonly used by marketers. Apple's 1984 ad, emphasizing individuality and freedom, exemplifies this added level of influence. Apple created an advertisement that drew on themes from Orwell's 1984 book that had strong themes against authority (WD From Marketinggoal, 2024). An individual may see this ad, with strong values against authority, and view it, and Apple Computers, to have a lasting and

permanent connection. Indeed, even forty years later, experts in advertising excellence have suggested that the Apple ad had many years of impact on its target market (Croll, 2024).

### **Evaluation of Advertising Effectiveness Considerations**

#### **Method**

This research used the Edwards Expert Judge Approach and selected ten expert judges who rated how well each of Table 1's Effective Advertising Considerations met each of the four integrated stages. An expert judge was either a university instructor or a doctoral student with experience teaching psychological motivation stages similar to those presented here, or had substantial marketing management experience in advertising-related areas. Ten judges appeared appropriate for this exploratory study; generally, at least three are needed (Rubio et al., 2003) and five are ideal for complex phenomena (Roebianto et al., 2023). Each rater completed a standardized rating form evaluating the strength of association between each quality and each motivational stage. Ratings were conducted independently, and no rater had prior access to the theoretical expectations or to other raters' responses. Reliability analyses and correlation matrices were used to assess interjudge consistency and are explained in the findings section below. Table 3, in the findings section, below, shows the average ratings for each evaluation for the definitions of the different stages.

#### **FINDINGS**

The findings about how well the different qualities of effective advertising reflect Kelman's (1958) and Ryan and Deci's (2017) theories of influence and motivation are discussed below and are shown in Table 2 after this paragraph. The expert judges appeared to rate these qualities reliably. For example, the overall interjudge reliability, as measured by Cronbach's alpha, was high ( $\alpha = .86$ ), indicating strong consistency across the ten experts. Interjudge agreement was substantial, with two-thirds of all expert judge pairs showing correlations of .50 or greater. Together with the shared professional background of the judges, these values affirm the strength of the expert evaluation process and reinforce confidence in the resulting findings.

**Table 2: Expert Judge Average Ratings of the Qualities of Advertising Excellence**

Advertising Quality	Compliance/ External Regulation	Identification/ Identified Regulation	Internalization/ Integrated Regulation	Internalization/Intrinsic Motivation
Tell a compelling emotional story, not just convey info	2.30	4.60	6.50	7.80
Give the listener a "solution" to problems in life	4.60	6.40	7.00	7.40
Use emotion in the ad's story	3.20	4.80	7.00	7.80
Show a sense of urgency	7.80	5.30	2.40	3.50
Provide "symbolic language" that captures the senses	3.40	5.40	6.90	7.90
"Show," not tell in the ad	3.40	5.70	6.30	7.20
How your product will change customers' worlds	4.90	5.40	7.20	7.30
Determine why you are the best and "say it"	5.20	7.20	4.20	5.50
Make sure your ad stands out	5.70	4.50	4.20	4.50
Unique Selling Proposition (USP)	5.90	6.70	4.50	5.30
Make the viewer think	2.80	4.80	7.70	8.40
Be relatable to the listener	4.80	6.70	7.20	7.90
Get the listener to believe in themselves	2.80	5.60	8.90	8.30
Help people realize they can overcome in life	2.80	4.60	8.70	8.80
Put the listener in the characters' shoes	2.80	5.80	7.60	8.50
Offer realism	4.40	6.40	5.80	6.10
Be memorable	4.40	6.90	6.50	7.30
Call the listener to action	7.60	6.20	3.60	4.50
Get immediate attention and maintain it	7.70	6.80	4.90	5.90
Repeat the ad often for interest	7.20	5.80	2.70	3.80
Stand out from competitors' messages	6.70	6.30	3.80	5.00
Have a "powerful idea" that stands out	4.70	7.30	5.90	6.70

Table 2 presents expert evaluations of twenty-two advertising qualities rated across four motivational stages, representing the theoretical models of Kelman (1958) and Ryan and Deci (2017). The patterns of scores do not suggest uniform effectiveness; rather, they convey distinct psychological roles for each advertising quality. These findings support the notion that advertising excellence varies by the level of motivational depth the message is intended to reach.

Several qualities, such as "show a sense of urgency" and "repeat the ad often," received the highest scores in the Compliance stage. These qualities are designed to activate immediate behavioral responses, often through pressure or frequency. Their scores drop substantially in the deeper stages, indicating that urgency or repetition alone does not foster long-term psychological commitment. These qualities, while useful for initial attention, appear limited in terms of enduring influence. These qualities, and all others in Table 2, were selected because they were repeatedly found to represent "excellence in advertising." Although qualities of "excellence," they did not appear to be consistently excellent throughout all stages of marketing communication.

In contrast, qualities such as "get the listener to believe in him or herself," "help people realize they can overcome in life," and "make the viewer think" received high scores in the Internalization and Intrinsic Regulation stages. They speak to the consumer's self-concept, empowerment, and reflective meaning-making. These results show that the deepest forms of motivational influence come not from repetition or instruction, but from an ad's ability to connect with personal values and internal psychological needs. Marketing strategists often find that truly excellent advertising does not persuade from the outside in it inspires from the inside out. When an ad relates to the consumer's core identity and fosters a sense of personal meaning, according to Batra and Keller (2016), it transcends persuasion and becomes a catalyst for self-directed engagement.

A third group of qualities such as "use emotion in the ad's story," "symbolic language that touches the senses," and "relatability" performed well across both the Identification and Internalization stages. These transitional strategies seem to help bridge early message engagement with deeper psychological commitment. They draw the audience in emotionally and can nudge motivation from extrinsic to intrinsic. The consistent strength of these qualities supports their value in stage-transition messaging.

Also notable are qualities that performed unevenly across stages. For example, "determine why you are the best and say it" was rated highly at the Identification stage but dropped at Internalization. Similarly, "unique selling proposition" (USP) strategies scored moderately across most stages but showed limited impact at the deepest levels of motivational influence. Although the USP has been a foundational concept in marketing since McCarthy's 1960 textbook (*Basic Marketing*) introduced it (McCarthy, 1960), the current results suggest that its influence may be limited when aiming for more intrinsically motivated stages. In such cases, additional qualities such as those that help people realize they can overcome in life or make the viewer think may be more effective in generating a deeper "intrinsic motivation," or psychological engagement.

Overall, the findings show that IMC strategies must be crafted with awareness of motivational stage involved. Qualities that engage the senses, challenge thinking, and promote self-belief were most effective at Internalization and Intrinsic stages. Meanwhile, urgency, repetition, and informational dominance remained surface-level tools. The results reinforce the importance of

designing advertising qualities not just for clarity or attention, but for how they support deeper psychological changes.

## Discussion

These findings advance the field's understanding of advertising excellence, not as a static trait or creative flourish, but as a dynamic function about how specific advertising qualities relate to motivational stages of influence. Rather than viewing excellence through traditional measures, such as recall or aesthetics, this study offers a structured, psychologically grounded framework that explains why certain messages succeed and when they are most effective.

Compliance-stage strategies such as urgency, command, and repetition proved useful for immediate behavioral activation, but fell short in deeper motivational impact. Although they may initiate awareness or drive quick action, their influence is often short-lived and transactional. In contrast, advertising qualities that fostered meaning-making, empowerment, and reflective engagement such as helping the viewer believe in themselves or recognize their capacity to overcome adversity received the highest expert ratings for the deepest stages of influence: Internalization and Intrinsic Regulation. These qualities mark the apex of advertising excellence, where a campaign is not merely persuasive but transformative.

Importantly, the results demonstrate that excellence is not a one-size-fits-all concept. Transitional qualities, including symbolic imagery, relatability, and emotionally engaging storytelling, performed well across both the Identification and Internalization stages. These middle-tier strategies offer a bridge, helping campaigns evolve from surface-level appeal to identity-relevant impact. In practical terms, this means that not all ads must immediately target intrinsic values; instead, campaign planners can intentionally sequence messaging that moves audiences from compliance to commitment. This approach provides a new blueprint for integrated marketing communications (IMC): one that is responsive to consumer psychology and deeply related to long-term behavioral change.

Theoretically, this study makes a significant contribution by integrating two influential models Kelman's (1958) stages of social influence and Ryan and Deci's (2017) self-determination framework into a unified framework of motivational depth. Although originally developed in different contexts, these theories are synthesized here into a unified framework for advertising strategy. The combined model helps explain not only how messages influence behavior, but also how they support or reduce psychological development along a continuum of motivation.

Most importantly, this paper contributes to the evolving concept of marketing excellence. It shifts the focus from tactical outcomes to strategic alignment between message and human motivation. Excellence in advertising is not simply about crafting a clever slogan or a vivid image; it is about understanding where the audience is in their motivational journey, and selecting message qualities that meet them there. This model encourages advertisers to think beyond AIDA's linear funnel and adopt a layered approach that respects the complexity of psychological engagement. In doing so, the framework redefines excellence as both outcome-driven and meaning-rich, where the most effective campaigns are those that foster lasting identity connection and internalized value.

By bridging empirical expert ratings with established psychological theory, this research offers both scholars and practitioners a more nuanced and usable map for designing persuasive, ethical, and enduring advertising strategies. It stands as a step forward in defining what truly

makes advertising excellent, not just in appearance or impact, but in how deeply it connects with the human experience.

## Conclusion

This study examined advertising effectiveness through the integration of Kelman's social influence theory and Ryan and Deci's self-determination framework, providing a comprehensive analysis of how specific advertising qualities relate to progressive stages of consumer psychological engagement. The research yielded several important conclusions.

First, advertising excellence is not monolithic but varies according to the motivational depth intended. Qualities effective at the Compliance stage (urgency, repetition, calls to action) differ substantially from those effective at Internalization and Intrinsic Regulation stages (empowerment, self-belief, reflective meaning-making). This finding challenges the assumption that a single set of "best practices" applies universally across all advertising contexts.

Second, the integration of Kelman's and Ryan and Deci's frameworks provides a more complete theoretical foundation for understanding advertising effectiveness than either theory alone. The combined model explains both the social mechanisms of influence and the psychological processes of motivation, offering richer insight into consumer response patterns.

Third, transitional advertising qualities those emphasizing emotion, symbolism, and relatability serve as bridges between compliance-oriented and intrinsic motivation stages. This finding supports a sequential approach to IMC campaign design, where initial messages establish attention and connection, while subsequent messages deepen psychological engagement.

Fourth, the highest forms of advertising excellence those achieving strong ratings at Internalization and Intrinsic Regulation stages involve qualities that connect with consumers' self-concept, values, and sense of personal meaning. Such advertising transcends persuasion to become genuinely transformative in the consumer's relationship with the brand.

## Implications and Recommendations

### Implications for Theory

This research extends advertising effectiveness theory by demonstrating that Kelman's social influence stages and Ryan and Deci's motivation continuum can be meaningfully integrated. Future theoretical work should explore additional intersections between social psychology and motivation theory in marketing contexts. The finding that specific advertising qualities map differentially to motivational stages suggests that advertising theory should move beyond one-dimensional effectiveness measures toward multi-stage frameworks that capture psychological depth.

### Implications for Practice

Practitioners should consider the following recommendations. First, assess the current motivational stage of the target audience before selecting advertising qualities. Audiences unfamiliar with a brand may respond best to compliance-oriented qualities, while loyal customers may engage more deeply with internalization-focused messages. Second, design IMC campaigns as progressive journeys that sequence advertising qualities from compliance through identification to internalization. Third, evaluate advertising effectiveness not only through immediate behavioral metrics but also through measures of psychological engagement

and identity connection. Fourth, invest in advertising qualities that foster self-belief, empowerment, and meaning-making for campaigns targeting long-term brand loyalty.

### **Implications for Policy**

The integrated framework supports ethical advertising practices by distinguishing between surface-level manipulation (compliance tactics) and deeper psychological engagement (internalization qualities). Regulatory bodies and industry associations may benefit from frameworks that differentiate advertising approaches based on their psychological impact. Advertising that fosters genuine consumer empowerment and self-determination represents a higher standard of practice than that which relies solely on urgency and pressure tactics.

### **Limitations and Future Research**

This study has limitations that suggest directions for future research. The advertising qualities evaluated emerged from student assessments rather than systematic content analysis, which may limit their comprehensiveness. Future research should validate these qualities against broader samples of successful advertising campaigns. The expert judge methodology, while appropriate for exploratory research, should be complemented by consumer response studies that measure actual psychological engagement across motivational stages. Additionally, cross-cultural research is needed to determine whether the relationships between advertising qualities and motivational stages hold across different cultural contexts. Finally, longitudinal studies tracking consumer-brand relationships over time would strengthen the evidence for the sequential IMC approach recommended by this research.

**AI Assistance Disclosure:** This manuscript was written and conceptualized by the authors. Minor editorial support, such as grammar and phrasing refinement, was provided using AI-assisted writing tools (e.g., ChatGPT), under the direct authorship and supervision of the submitting authors.

**Conflict of Interest Statement:** The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest related to the research, authorship, or publication of this manuscript.

**Funding Statement:** No funding was received for this research.

## REFERENCES

Apple Inc. (1997, September 28). Here's to the crazy ones [Advertisement]. TBWA\Chiat\Day for Apple. <https://www.thecrazyones.it/spot-en.html>

Association of National Advertisers. (2024). *The economic impact of advertising in the United States*. ANA. <https://www.ana.net/content/show/id/economic-impact-study-2024>

Batra, R., & Keller, K. L. (2016). Integrating marketing communications: New findings, new lessons, and new ideas. *Journal of Marketing*, 80(6), 122-145.

Baumeister, R. F., Vohs, K. D., & Funder, D. C. (2022). Psychology as a science: Ecological and conceptual validity in theory development. *Perspectives on Psychological Science*, 17(2), 432-446. <https://doi.org/10.1177/17456916211073203>

Belch, G. E., & Belch, M. A. (2021). *Advertising and promotion: An integrated marketing communications perspective* (12th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.

Burnett, L. (1961). *Advertising principles and practices*. Leo Burnett Ad Agency.

Croll, T. (2024). Expert evaluations of impactful advertising campaigns. *Journal of Advertising Studies*, 32(2), 45-58.

Eisend, M., & Farid, S. (2016). Emotional resonance in advertising: The role of affective persuasion. *Marketing Letters*, 27(1), 21-32.

Heath, R. (2007). *The hidden power of advertising: How low involvement processing influences consumer choice*. Admap Publications.

Homberg, C., Day, G. S., & Moorman, C. (2020). Managerial competencies for marketing excellence. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 36(5-6), 765-789.

Kelman, H. C. (1958). Compliance, identification, and internalization: Three processes of attitude change. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 2(1), 51-60.

Kelman, H. C. (1974). Further thoughts on the processes of compliance, identification, and internalization. In J. T. Tedeschi (Ed.), *Perspectives on social power* (pp. 125-171). Aldine.

Kotler, P., & Keller, K. L. (2016). *Marketing management* (15th ed.). Pearson Education.

Kotler, P., Keller, K. L., & Chernev, A. (2022). *Marketing management* (16th ed.). Pearson Education.

McCarthy, E. J. (1960). *Basic marketing: A managerial approach*. R. D. Irwin.

Moorman, C., & Day, G. S. (2016). Organizing for marketing excellence: The 4 C's framework. *Journal of Marketing*, 80(6), 20-34.

Nielsen. (2017). *The truth about advertising effectiveness*. Nielsen Insights Report. <https://www.nielsen.com/insights/2017/the-truth-about-advertising-effectiveness/>

Ogilvy, D. (1983). *Ogilvy on advertising*. Crown Publishers.

Oliver, R. L. (1999). Whence consumer loyalty? *Journal of Marketing*, 63(4), 33-44.

Rawal, P. (2013). Engaging emotions in advertising. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 5(4), 1-8.

Roebianto, A., Nugroho, M. A., & Putri, D. A. (2023). Emotional appeal and advertising effectiveness: Evidence from digital platforms. *Journal of Marketing Science*, 18(2), 111-129.

Rubio, D. M., Berg-Weger, M., Tebb, S. S., Lee, E. S., & Rauch, S. (2003). Objectifying content validity: Conducting a content validity study in social work research. *Social Work Research*, 27(2), 94-104.

Rucker, D. D., & Calkins, T. (2024). Advertising strategy for the modern consumer. *Marketing Insights Journal*, 45(1), 100-118.

Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2000). Self-determination theory and the facilitation of intrinsic motivation, social development, and well-being. *American Psychologist*, 55(1), 68-78. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.55.1.68>

Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2017). *Self-determination theory: Basic psychological needs in motivation, development, and wellness*. Guilford Press.

Tristanto, A. J., Sutanto, J. E., & Matulessy, A. (2021). Desire as a critical factor in AIDA effectiveness. *Asian Journal of Marketing*, 13(3), 82-88.

WD From Marketinggoal. (2024). Apple 1984 commercial analysis. *Marketing History Archives*.

WPP Media. (2025). *This year, next year: Global ad spend forecast*. GroupM. <https://www.groupm.com/this-year-next-year>

Zarantonello, L., Schmitt, B. H., & Jedidi, K. (2020). Consumer response to advertising: The role of emotional and cognitive processes. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 37(4), 748-765. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijresmar.2020.02.003>