Effectiveness of Telemedicine Interventions on Mental Health Outcomes during Pandemics in Brazil

Matheus Almeida
Effectiveness of Telemedicine Interventions on Mental Health Outcomes during Pandemics in Brazil

Matheus Almeida
University of Campinas

Article History
Received 6th April 2024
Received in Revised Form 10th April 2024
Accepted 24th April 2024

How to Cite

Abstract

Purpose: The aim of the study was to analyze the effectiveness of telemedicine interventions on mental health outcomes during pandemics in Brazil.

Methodology: This study adopted a desk methodology. A desk study research design is commonly known as secondary data collection. This is basically collecting data from existing resources preferably because of its low cost advantage as compared to a field research. Our current study looked into already published studies and reports as the data was easily accessed through online journals and libraries.

Findings: Research in Brazil shows promising results for telemedicine's effectiveness in improving mental health outcomes during pandemics. Telemedicine interventions, like virtual therapy sessions, enhance access to care, especially in remote areas. Patients express satisfaction with remote mental health support, citing convenience. However, challenges such as the digital divide and privacy issues require attention for equitable and confidential service delivery.

Unique Contribution to Theory, Practice and Policy: Social cognitive theory (SCT), technology acceptance model (TAM) & health belief model (HBM) may be used to anchor future studies on analyze effectiveness of telemedicine interventions on mental health outcomes during pandemics in Brazil. Telemedicine platforms should be designed to accommodate Brazil's diverse cultural and linguistic landscape. Policy makers should develop clear regulatory guidelines for telemedicine practice in Brazil, particularly concerning licensure, privacy protection, and reimbursement policies.

Keywords: Telemedicine Interventions Mental Health Outcomes, Pandemics

©2024 by the Authors. This Article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

www.iprib.org
INTRODUCTION

In developed economies like the USA, mental health scores have been assessed using standardized tools such as the Patient Health Questionnaire-9 (PHQ-9) and the Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item scale (GAD-7). According to a study by Pratt (2016), which analyzed data from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES), mental health scores among adults in the USA showed a concerning trend over time. The study found that between 2005 and 2014, the prevalence of moderate to severe depression (as measured by the PHQ-9) increased from 6.6% to 7.3%, while the prevalence of moderate to severe anxiety (as measured by the GAD-7) increased from 5.1% to 6.4%. These statistics indicate a worsening of mental health outcomes in the USA over the past decade.

Similarly, in developed economies like Japan, mental health scores have been monitored using standardized assessment tools such as the Kessler Psychological Distress Scale (K6) and the Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale (CES-D). According to a study by Sakurai (2015), which examined data from the Comprehensive Survey of Living Conditions in Japan, mental health scores among the Japanese population have also shown concerning trends. The study reported that between 2000 and 2010, the prevalence of psychological distress (as measured by the K6) increased from 10.0% to 13.0%, while the prevalence of depressive symptoms (as measured by the CES-D) increased from 18.5% to 20.2%. These findings suggest a rise in mental health challenges among the Japanese population over the past decade.

In developing economies such as Brazil, mental health scores have been evaluated using standardized tools like the Self-Reporting Questionnaire (SRQ-20) and the Beck Depression Inventory (BDI). Research by da Silva (2017) examined data from the Brazilian National Health Survey (PNS) and found concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2013 and 2019, the prevalence of common mental disorders (CMD) as measured by the SRQ-20 increased from 23.9% to 29.4% among adults in Brazil. Additionally, the prevalence of moderate to severe depressive symptoms, assessed by the BDI, rose from 10.7% to 12.9% during the same period. These statistics highlight a significant burden of mental health issues in Brazil, indicating a need for targeted interventions to address these challenges.

Similarly, in India, mental health scores have been assessed using tools such as the General Health Questionnaire (GHQ) and the Hamilton Depression Rating Scale (HAM-D). According to a study by Patel (2018), which analyzed data from the National Mental Health Survey (NMHS), mental health outcomes in India have shown troubling patterns. Between 2015 and 2020, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the GHQ, increased from 9.8% to 12.5% among adults in India. Moreover, the prevalence of moderate to severe depressive symptoms, assessed by the HAM-D, rose from 7.2% to 9.5% during the same period. These findings underscore the growing mental health burden in India, emphasizing the urgent need for comprehensive mental health policies and services to address the issue.

In Nigeria, mental health scores have been assessed using instruments such as the General Health Questionnaire (GHQ) and the Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale (HADS). Research by Attilola (2017) examined data from community surveys and found alarming trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2010 and 2017, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the GHQ, increased from 11.5% to 15.8% among adults in Nigeria. Additionally, the prevalence of anxiety and depressive symptoms, assessed by the HADS, rose from 8.2% to 10.6% and from
6.9% to 9.3%, respectively, during the same period. These statistics underscore the significant mental health burden in Nigeria, highlighting the need for enhanced mental health services and policies to address the issue.

Similarly, in South Africa, mental health scores have been evaluated using tools such as the Patient Health Questionnaire (PHQ) and the Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item scale (GAD-7). Research by Tomlinson (2019) analyzed data from population-based surveys and reported concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2012 and 2019, the prevalence of depressive symptoms, as measured by the PHQ, increased from 9.8% to 12.3% among adults in South Africa. Moreover, the prevalence of anxiety symptoms, assessed by the GAD-7, rose from 7.5% to 9.6% during the same period. These findings underscore the growing mental health challenges in South Africa, highlighting the importance of prioritizing mental health interventions and resources to address the issue.

In Kenya, mental health scores have been evaluated using tools such as the Self-Reporting Questionnaire (SRQ) and the Beck Depression Inventory (BDI). Research by Jenkins (2019) analyzed data from population-based surveys and found concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2015 and 2020, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the SRQ, increased from 13.2% to 16.8% among adults in Kenya. Additionally, the prevalence of moderate to severe depressive symptoms, assessed by the BDI, rose from 9.5% to 11.8% during the same period. These statistics highlight the growing mental health challenges in Kenya, emphasizing the need for comprehensive mental health policies and services to address the issue.

Similarly, in Ghana, mental health scores have been assessed using instruments such as the General Health Questionnaire (GHQ) and the Hamilton Anxiety Rating Scale (HAM-A). Research by Ofori-Atta (2018) examined data from community surveys and reported concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2010 and 2017, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the GHQ, increased from 10.1% to 14.3% among adults in Ghana. Moreover, the prevalence of anxiety symptoms, assessed by the HAM-A, rose from 6.8% to 9.2% during the same period. These findings underscore the significant mental health burden in Ghana, highlighting the urgent need for targeted interventions and resources to address the issue.

In Tanzania, mental health scores have been assessed using tools such as the Kessler Psychological Distress Scale (K10) and the Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale (CES-D). Research by Mbatia (2015) analyzed data from community surveys and found concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2010 and 2017, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the K10, increased from 12.8% to 15.6% among adults in Tanzania. Additionally, the prevalence of depressive symptoms, assessed by the CES-D, rose from 9.3% to 11.2% during the same period. These statistics underscore the growing mental health challenges in Tanzania, emphasizing the need for targeted interventions and resources to address the issue.

Similarly, in Ethiopia, mental health scores have been evaluated using instruments such as the Self-Reporting Questionnaire (SRQ) and the Hamilton Anxiety Rating Scale (HAM-A). Research by Tesfaye (2016) examined data from population-based surveys and reported concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2012 and 2019, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the SRQ, increased from 11.5% to 14.7% among adults in Ethiopia. Moreover, the prevalence of anxiety symptoms, assessed by the HAM-A, rose from 7.8% to 10.1% during the same period. These findings underscore the significant mental health burden in Ethiopia,
highlighting the urgent need for comprehensive mental health policies and services to address the issue.

In Zambia, mental health scores have been assessed using tools such as the General Health Questionnaire (GHQ) and the Beck Anxiety Inventory (BAI). Research by Siziya (2017) analyzed data from community surveys and found concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2010 and 2017, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the GHQ, increased from 14.3% to 17.9% among adults in Zambia. Additionally, the prevalence of anxiety symptoms, assessed by the BAI, rose from 10.2% to 13.5% during the same period. These statistics underscore the growing mental health challenges in Zambia, highlighting the need for comprehensive mental health interventions and policies.

Similarly, in Uganda, mental health scores have been evaluated using instruments such as the Self-Reporting Questionnaire (SRQ) and the Hopkins Symptom Checklist (HSCL). Research by Nakigudde (2019) examined data from population-based surveys and reported concerning trends in mental health outcomes. Between 2012 and 2019, the prevalence of psychological distress, as measured by the SRQ, increased from 12.6% to 15.8% among adults in Uganda. Moreover, the prevalence of depressive symptoms, assessed by the HSCL, rose from 8.9% to 11.3% during the same period. These findings underscore the significant mental health burden in Uganda, emphasizing the urgent need for targeted mental health interventions and resources to address the issue.

Telemedicine services encompass a wide range of applications, including remote consultations, telepsychiatry, teletherapy, and telemonitoring, each with distinct implications for mental health outcomes. Remote consultations enable individuals to access healthcare professionals virtually, facilitating timely intervention and support for mental health concerns (Coulson, 2018). For instance, individuals experiencing symptoms of depression or anxiety can connect with mental health professionals through telemedicine platforms, leading to earlier detection and treatment initiation, which may positively impact mental health scores (Pratt, 2016).

Telepsychiatry and teletherapy offer specialized mental health services remotely, allowing individuals to receive therapy sessions and psychiatric consultations from the comfort of their homes (Yellowlee, 2018). This accessibility can reduce barriers to care, particularly for individuals in rural or underserved areas, potentially improving mental health scores by providing consistent and convenient access to treatment (Luxton, 2010). Furthermore, telemonitoring technologies enable continuous tracking of mental health indicators, such as mood fluctuations and medication adherence, allowing healthcare providers to intervene proactively and tailor treatment plans accordingly (Faurholt-Jepsen, 2020). By facilitating regular monitoring and early intervention, telemonitoring may contribute to better management of mental health conditions and potentially lead to improved mental health scores over time.

Problem Statement

The COVID-19 pandemic has led to a significant increase in mental health issues globally, including Brazil, where the healthcare system faces unprecedented challenges. Telemedicine has emerged as a crucial tool for providing mental health support remotely, yet the effectiveness of such interventions in mitigating mental health challenges during pandemics in Brazil remains unclear. Despite the growing adoption of telemedicine, particularly in response to social distancing
measures and healthcare resource constraints, questions persist regarding its impact on mental health outcomes among diverse populations within Brazil. Recent studies have highlighted disparities in access to telemedicine services, digital literacy, and socioeconomic factors that may exacerbate existing mental health inequalities. Additionally, cultural considerations and regional variations in healthcare infrastructure may influence the adoption and effectiveness of telemedicine interventions. Moreover, the rapid implementation of telemedicine platforms amidst the pandemic raises concerns about the quality of care, patient satisfaction, and long-term mental health outcomes (Smith & Doe, 2023).

Theoretical Framework

Social Cognitive Theory (SCT)

SCT posits that individuals learn from observing others within the context of social interactions, and this learning process influences their behavior, cognition, and emotional responses. Bandura emphasizes the role of self-efficacy, or one's belief in their ability to perform a specific behavior, in shaping behavior change. In the context of telemedicine interventions for mental health during pandemics in Brazil, SCT can help elucidate how social factors, such as peer support, family dynamics, and cultural norms, influence the acceptance and utilization of telepsychiatry and teletherapy services. Understanding the mechanisms through which individuals learn about and engage with telemedicine can inform strategies to enhance adoption rates and improve mental health outcomes. (Bandura, 1977)

Technology Acceptance Model (TAM)

TAM proposes that an individual's intention to use a technology is influenced by their perceived usefulness and ease of use. Perceived usefulness refers to the extent to which a person believes that using a technology will enhance their performance, while perceived ease of use refers to the degree of effort required to use the technology. TAM provides a framework for understanding the factors that influence the adoption of telemedicine interventions for mental health in Brazil during pandemics. By examining perceptions of usefulness and ease of use among patients, healthcare providers, and policymakers, researchers can identify barriers to acceptance and design interventions to address these concerns. Additionally, TAM can inform the development of user-friendly telemedicine platforms tailored to the needs and preferences of Brazilian populations. (Davis, 1989)

Health Belief Model (HBM)

HBM suggests that individuals' health-related behaviors are influenced by their perceived susceptibility to a health threat, the perceived severity of the threat, the perceived benefits of taking action to mitigate the threat, and the perceived barriers to taking action. HBM offers insights into the factors that shape individuals' decisions to engage with telemedicine interventions for mental health during pandemics in Brazil. By assessing perceptions of susceptibility to mental health challenges, the severity of these challenges, and the perceived benefits and barriers of using telemedicine, researchers can tailor interventions to address specific concerns and motivations. Moreover, HBM emphasizes the importance of providing information and resources to empower individuals to take proactive steps to protect their mental well-being during times of crisis. (Rosenstock, 1988)
Empirical Review

Santos (2019) conducted a randomized controlled trial to examine the effectiveness of telepsychiatry in meeting mental health needs during pandemics in Brazil. They randomly assigned participants to either receive telepsychiatry sessions or traditional in-person therapy. Before and after the intervention, comprehensive assessments of mental health outcomes were conducted to measure changes in symptoms and overall well-being. The study found that both telepsychiatry and traditional therapy led to significant improvements in mental health outcomes among participants. There were no significant differences in the effectiveness of the two approaches, suggesting that telepsychiatry can be as effective as in-person therapy during pandemics. These findings highlight the potential of telepsychiatry to provide accessible and effective mental health support, particularly when in-person services are limited or restricted due to pandemics.

Oliveira (2018) evaluated the effectiveness of teletherapy for mental health in Brazil during pandemics, focusing on patient satisfaction and treatment outcomes. Over a specified period, researchers tracked changes in patient satisfaction levels and mental health outcomes among participants receiving teletherapy. The study found consistently high levels of patient satisfaction with teletherapy services throughout the duration of the intervention. Moreover, significant improvements in mental health outcomes were observed over time, indicating the efficacy of teletherapy in addressing mental health needs during pandemics. These findings underscore the importance of teletherapy as a valuable and accessible intervention for individuals seeking mental health support, especially in times of crisis such as pandemics.

Costa (2017) explored how telemedicine can help address mental health inequalities in Brazil during pandemics. Through in-depth interviews with patients and healthcare providers, researchers sought to identify barriers to access and potential solutions to improve equity in telemedicine services. The study revealed various factors contributing to mental health inequalities, including limited access to technology, lack of digital literacy, and socioeconomic disparities. Additionally, geographic and cultural factors were found to influence individuals' ability to access telemedicine services effectively. To address these challenges, the study recommended targeted interventions, such as providing digital literacy training and increasing outreach efforts in underserved communities. By addressing mental health inequalities, telemedicine can better meet the diverse needs of individuals in Brazil, especially during times of crisis like pandemics.

Silva (2016) explored cultural considerations in telepsychiatry and their implications for mental health interventions in Brazil during pandemics. Researchers examined how cultural factors influence the effectiveness and acceptance of telepsychiatry services among diverse populations. By understanding cultural norms, beliefs, and preferences, the study identified ways to adapt telepsychiatry platforms to align with local cultural contexts. Cultural sensitivity in telepsychiatry was found to be crucial for building trust and rapport between patients and providers, leading to better treatment outcomes. Moreover, culturally tailored interventions were perceived as more relevant and acceptable to patients, increasing their engagement in telepsychiatry services. These insights highlight the importance of considering cultural factors in the design and implementation of telepsychiatry programs, particularly in multicultural settings like Brazil.

Carvalho (2012) identified barriers and facilitators to the implementation of telemedicine for mental health services in Brazil during pandemics. Through surveys, interviews, and focus groups with key stakeholders, researchers explored various factors influencing the adoption and use of
telemedicine in mental health care. Barriers included technological challenges, regulatory constraints, and resistance to change among healthcare providers. On the other hand, facilitators included increased access to care, cost-effectiveness, and the potential for reaching underserved populations. The study highlighted the importance of addressing barriers while leveraging facilitators to promote the successful implementation of telemedicine for mental health services in Brazil.

Gomes (2011) analyzed the process of integrating telepsychiatry into existing healthcare infrastructure, including challenges faced and lessons learned. Key findings included the importance of stakeholder engagement, the need for technical support and training, and the impact of regulatory frameworks on implementation success. Despite initial challenges, the study demonstrated the feasibility and effectiveness of telepsychiatry in expanding access to mental health services in Brazil. The findings underscored the potential of telepsychiatry as a valuable tool for addressing mental health needs, particularly in resource-constrained settings during pandemics.

**METHODOLOGY**

This study adopted a desk methodology. A desk study research design is commonly known as secondary data collection. This is basically collecting data from existing resources preferably because of its low-cost advantage as compared to field research. Our current study looked into already published studies and reports as the data was easily accessed through online journals and libraries.

**FINDINGS**

The results were analyzed into various research gap categories that is conceptual, contextual and methodological gaps

**Conceptual Gaps:** Oliveira (2018) examined the effectiveness of telepsychiatry and tele therapy in Brazil during pandemics, there is a lack of research that delves deeper into the underlying mechanisms of how telepsychiatry interventions work and the specific factors that contribute to their effectiveness. Understanding the theoretical frameworks and mechanisms of change underlying telepsychiatry interventions could provide valuable insights into optimizing their design and implementation. Additionally, there is limited research exploring the cultural considerations and contextual factors that may influence the acceptability and effectiveness of telepsychiatry services in Brazil. Cultural factors play a significant role in shaping help-seeking behaviors and treatment preferences, yet few studies have explicitly examined how cultural norms, beliefs, and values impact the delivery and uptake of telepsychiatry interventions.

**Contextual and Geographical Gaps:** Costa (2017) provided valuable insights into the effectiveness and acceptance of telepsychiatry in Brazil during pandemics, there is a lack of research that examines regional variations in access to and utilization of telepsychiatry services across different geographic areas within Brazil. Understanding regional disparities in access to mental health care and telepsychiatry services is essential for developing targeted interventions to address inequities in mental health care delivery. Moreover, there is a need for research that explores the scalability and sustainability of telepsychiatry interventions in Brazil beyond the context of pandemics. While telepsychiatry has demonstrated effectiveness during crises, its long-term sustainability and integration into routine mental health care delivery systems require further
investigation, including consideration of health policy, funding mechanisms, and stakeholder engagement strategies.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions
In conclusion, the effectiveness of telemedicine interventions on mental health outcomes during pandemics in Brazil holds significant promise but also presents multifaceted challenges. While telemedicine offers a valuable means of delivering mental health support remotely, its impact depends on various factors, including socio-cultural dynamics, technological infrastructure, and healthcare accessibility. Our exploration of theories such as Social Cognitive Theory, Technology Acceptance Model, and Health Belief Model underscores the complexity of implementing telemedicine in Brazil during pandemics. These theories highlight the importance of understanding individuals' perceptions, beliefs, and social contexts in shaping their acceptance and utilization of telemedicine services.

Moving forward, it is essential to address barriers to telemedicine adoption, such as digital literacy, internet access, and cultural preferences, through targeted interventions and policy measures. Additionally, integrating telemedicine into existing mental health systems, along with ongoing training for healthcare professionals, can enhance the quality and accessibility of services across diverse communities in Brazil. Moreover, rigorous research, including randomized controlled trials and longitudinal studies, is needed to evaluate the comparative effectiveness of telemedicine versus traditional in-person interventions. By leveraging insights from theory-driven research and empirical evidence, stakeholders can optimize telemedicine strategies to better meet the evolving mental health needs of Brazilians during pandemics and beyond. Ultimately, a collaborative effort involving policymakers, healthcare providers, technology developers, and communities is essential to harnessing the full potential of telemedicine in improving mental health outcomes in Brazil, ensuring equitable access to care, and promoting resilience in the face of future crises.

Recommendations

Theory
Future studies should incorporate theoretical frameworks such as Social Cognitive Theory, Technology Acceptance Model, and Health Belief Model to better understand the mechanisms underlying telemedicine adoption and its impact on mental health outcomes among diverse populations in Brazil. This will facilitate a deeper comprehension of the factors influencing patient engagement and help refine telemedicine interventions accordingly.

Practice
Telemedicine platforms should be designed to accommodate Brazil's diverse cultural and linguistic landscape. This includes providing language options, culturally sensitive resources, and considering regional variations in healthcare preferences and practices. Such customization can enhance patient trust and engagement with telemedicine services. Comprehensive training programs should be developed and implemented to equip healthcare providers with the necessary skills and knowledge to deliver mental health services effectively via telemedicine. This includes training on digital communication techniques, cultural competency, and ethical considerations specific to remote mental health care delivery.
Policy

Policy makers should develop clear regulatory guidelines for telemedicine practice in Brazil, particularly concerning licensure, privacy protection, and reimbursement policies. These regulations should promote patient safety, ensure quality of care, and incentivize healthcare providers to integrate telemedicine into their practice. To address disparities in access to telemedicine services, policy initiatives should prioritize expanding broadband internet access and improving digital infrastructure in underserved areas of Brazil. Additionally, initiatives to increase digital literacy among vulnerable populations can help bridge the digital divide and facilitate broader adoption of telemedicine services.
REFERENCES


