

Journal of Public Policy and Administration (JPPA)

**An Investigation of the Transformation Process from Manual to
E-Recruitment in Tanzania Public Service**

Azah Y.Saad and Josephat Itika

An Investigation of the Transformation Process from Manual to E-Recruitment in Tanzania Public Service



Azah Y. Saad

Department of PS-HRM, Mzumbe, Morogoro, Tanzania.



Josephat Itika

Department of PS-HRM, Mzumbe, Morogoro, Tanzania.

Article History

Received 20th December 2023

Received in Revised Form 30th December 2023

Accepted 8th January 2024

Abstract

Purpose: The innovation of e-recruitment was to embrace the flow of recruitment and selection of young people in Tanzania public service. Currently, e-recruitment has not yet achieved the intended objectives. As a result, the wellbeing of the country human capital is being compromised. The extant studies have not examined the effectiveness of e-recruitment transformation process. In line with the existing gap, investigating the transformation process from manual to e-recruitment in Tanzania Public Services Recruitment Secretariat remains the focus of this study. Specifically, the study examined why e-recruitment was an alternative to the manual recruitment, the regulatory frameworks governing e-recruitment, e-recruitment implementation strategies, and processes and finding out how the management of forces for change may explain the reasons why e-recruitment does not meet the intended objectives.

Methodology: With the sample size of 25 respondents, five respondents were purposively interviewed and nine responded to questionnaires, and the remaining 16 respondent were conveniently distributed into two FGDs basing on their willingness, availability, willingness, and accessibility. Qualitative data were analysed using thematic and content analysis.

Findings: The findings revealed that the adoption of e-recruitment was due to challenges facing manual recruitment such as diseases, unfairness, insecurity of applicants' information, the cost of running the recruitment process and time. The e-government Act of 2019, e-government regulations of 2020 and the PSRS Rules of operations of 2021 were identified as the regulatory frameworks governing e-recruitment. The PSRS uses both human capital sand technological strategies in facilitating e-recruitment. Finally, the inability of using e-recruitment system, limited reach, budget constraints, and inadequate system integration were the reasons why e-recruitment does not meet the intended objectives.

Unique Contribution to Theory, Practice and Policy:

The study recommend for the government to ensure integration and interoperability of between e-recruitment system and other government systems for accurate data sharing and verification purposes.

Keywords: *E-Recruitment, E-Recruitment Transformation Process, Public Service*

©2024 by the Authors. This Article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>)

INTRODUCTION

The overgrowing population of young people has revealed the demand for Human Resource Management field (HRM) in the global context of linking technological infrastructure for the performance of both private and public organization remain the core function in the search for the most suitable human capitals (Rathee & Bhuntel, 2017). E-recruitment denotes the use of technological assistance in recruitment process, which includes the online application using websites, blogs, emails, and online portals with necessarily job information with a view of eradicating corruption, accelerating timely recruitment decisions and providing a wide range of job accessibility (Gusain *et al...*, 2023).

The innovation of e-recruitment was do away with experienced mistakes with traditional recruitment processes such as excessive cost in the recruitment procedures, limited penetration of job accessibility, nepotism and delays in the recruitment procedures (AL-Qassem *et al...*; 2023). The transformation from manual recruitment to e-recruitment has its origin in the USA in 1980s with the assistance of recruitment portals among many channels, which included Indeed.com, careerjet.com and freshersworld.com (Wozniak, 2014). The objective of starting e-recruitment in the USA was successful as the US had already been well equipped with technological infrastructures and clear communication strategic, which fast tracked the e-recruitment transformation (Simon & Esteves, 2016). Accordingly, the USA route towards e-recruitment transformation was fast and was quickly adopted by both private and public entities (Omolowali, 2015). Thus, the potentiality of e-recruitment in the USA has attracted and captured the most gifted human capitals in the global and has retained them in multinational corporations (Wozniak, 2015; Woziniak, 2014).

The great awakening in the African Union on reshaping the continent with capable people of accommodating robust social services under the vision, “*the Africa we want.*” The emphasis on attaining quality education, imperative economic status and the quest to be the producers of own consumptions has created the demand for healthy employment opportunities for the future of its young generation (African Head of State Summit on Human Capital (AHSSHC), 2023). In such a situation, the continent has made efforts to make employment recruitment with the assistance of ICT innovation as stipulated in the African Union Digital Transformation Strategy (AUDTS, 2030).

In Zimbabwe, the application of the nation's most widely used e-recruitment tools, such as business web pages and job sites verified that the country employs e-recruitment more often than the manual recruitment methods. Consequently, the country has increased its capacity to attain highly skilled and talented staffs (Manenji, 2019).

In Tanzania, the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat (PSRS) was established in 2007 under the Public Service Act No. 8 of 2002 as amended by Act No. 18 of 2007, section 29(1), as an independent department to facilitate the recruitment of employees in the Public Service (PO-PSM, 2007). In 2014, PSRS automated its recruitment processes using online recruitment portal (Ajira portal), with the aim of undertaking recruitment of public servants by using the modern approaches (Mshanga, 2020). The aim of the transformation to e-recruitment was to make the public sector more open to the interests of the people by increasing transparency, productivity, effectiveness, and timely decision-making in recruitment matters. This is a result of many reported cases, which used to impede transparency and competitiveness that predominate in the traditional recruitment process (Lufunyo, 2013; Mwashu 2013; Rewards 2018; Benson, 2020; Mshanga 2020). Despite the long survival of the available Public Service

Recruitment Secretariat, still e- recruitment has not yielded and eradicated the problems associated with the traditional recruitment. Currently, the system is only used for advertising new job positions (Mshanga 2020, Sikawa, 2023). In addition, according to Mshanga (2020), e-recruitment does not meet the intended objectives. Consequently, there is manipulation of information, delay in recruitment decisions and ending getting unqualified employees. The existing studies on e-recruitment have not examined the effectiveness of e-recruitment transformation process as proposed by Kurt Lewns theory of change.

In line with the existing gap, investigating the transformation process from manual to e-recruitment in Tanzania Public Services Recruitment Secretariat remains the focus of this study. Specifically, the study wanted to find out why e-recruitment was an alternative to the manual recruitment, to examine regulatory frameworks governing e-recruitment in the public service, to examine e-recruitment implementation strategies and processes, and to find out how the management of forces for change may explain the reasons as to why e-recruitment does not meet the intended objectives.

Theoretical Framework

This paper adopted Kurt Lewins' theory of change of 1951; the social scientist Kurt Lewin proposed the "Three-Stage Theory," as an upfront framework for understanding the process of organizational change. This change model was chosen in this paper because it provides a straightforward and clear explanation of the change process. The following components represent these stages:

a) Unfreezing

This phase involves challenging the status quo and making employees, departments, and organizations aware of the need for change and why the current system is no longer effective as well as introducing the regulatory frameworks that govern the change (Too, 2018). Specifically, unfreezing phase includes identifying areas in the recruitment that need improvement and emphasizing the benefits of implementing e-recruitment as well as providing policies, rules and regulations governing the transformation process (Fatoni et al., 2023; Ratana *et al.*, 2020).

b) Change

During this phase, both those leading the effort and those affected by it accept and internalize the change. Leaders and organizations should create strategies, clear plans of action, and tangible goals (Too, 2018). The change phase entails developing a strategy, creating a plan and process to introduce e-recruitment in the public service (Agazu et al., 2022; Gultom, 2021).

c) Refreezing

After the change is fully implemented, it is important to reflect on and reinforce the new procedures and systems while keeping in mind that continuous improvement is necessary (Gultom, 2021). Thus, refreezing should be accompanied by reviews and assessments of the new system to ensure continued success. When investigating the transition from manual to e-recruitment, Kurt Lewin Model of Change can provide a valuable framework for the process. This involves re-evaluating the new process, referring to pre-transformation benchmarks, and making any necessary modifications (Fatoni *et al.*, 2023). By utilizing this change model, the transformation from manual to e-recruitment can be managed more effectively and efficiently.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Anand and Radha (2020) define e-recruitment as the utilization of web-based technology for the various processes of attracting, evaluating, selecting, recruiting, and on-boarding job also known as online recruitment. The discussion of e-recruitment continued to attract attention of several studies; for example, Kaur and Kaur (2023) consider e-recruitment as an online process of evaluating, interviewing, and recruiting employees using technology, particularly websites. In this context, this study views e-recruitment as the act of advertising jobs through the use of internet sources such as online recruitment portal and other online job information sources. The system enables employers to reach a larger number of potential employees while candidates reduce the possibility of being biased because of human interest (Indira & Rathika, 2020).

The advent of e-recruitment did not bring sandstorms but it was intentionally designed and implemented to redress the traditional malfunction with the old recruitment procedures after the advent of e-government (Arrifuzzaman *et al...* 2023). The essence was to achieve effectiveness by its management in the recruitment process in different organizations (Sikawa 2023; Mwakasungula 2018). Thus, the view from HRM pioneers was a change of recruitment model; and the current studies admit that there is a need for the organization or a corporate to consider push and pull factors for the transformation to e-recruitment (Sultana, 2023). A change refers to tangible or intangible needs that demand implementing a change; these may include the adaptation stage to new market trends (Parry *et al...* 2014). The reasons for a change to e-recruitment are based on the challenges of traditional recruitment and benefits of the newly one. Kurt Lewns theory of change requires the established authority with change to explain the failure of the previous ways of doing things in comparison to the benefits of the current desired practices. According to Anduru *et al.* (2021), the excessive use of paperwork in HRM created room for corruption since people had plenty of room for engaging with officers in charge of recruitment procedures, thus this did not create suitable environment hiring appropriate candidates; hence, the toned for e-recruitment. However, linking the e-recruitment regulatory framework with the strategic reasons is better for its sustainability (AUDT, 2020).

In Tanzania, the government employs a vast of regulatory frameworks in running recruitment and selection procedures (PSRS, 2021). Examples of the regulatory frameworks in the use of e-recruitment are the e-government Act of 2019, e-government regulations of 2020, and the PSRS rules of operations of 2021 (URT, 2010). Most of e-recruitment regulatory frameworks struggle in accommodating the recent technology demand since they were crafted in line with traditional context even before the establishment of e-recruitment, these include the Public Service Standing Order of 2009, the National Employment Policy of 2008, the Public Service Act of 2002, the Public Service Regulation of 2003 and its scheme of 2004.

Consequently, the use of unsuitable policy within the ICT context compromised the use and provision of e-services (AUDT, 2020). In addition, delays in decision-making, cost, and unfairness, unqualified employees, corruption and nepotism continued to be cited as challenges facing traditional recruitment. Thus, due to challenges in traditional recruitment, Tanzania Government has attempted to introduce the use of e-government services in 2003, which among other services, was the introduction of e-recruitment in 2007, which the public services introduced as an independent authority vested with the powers to run all recruitment procedures in the public services (URT, 2007). These efforts were in line with the introduction of e-government Act of 2019, e-government strategy of 2022, and e-government regulations of

2020, Likewise, the independent organization for recruitment and selection in the public service (PSRS) decided to enact its own rules of operations in 2021cTANAPA was the first organization to implement e-recruitment. ,

Studies in e-recruitment (i.e. Malekano, 2021; Mshanga, 2020; Mwashu, 2013) still argue that, although the government focus was more on the establishment of e-recruitment, its long survival of almost 10 years and above has not yet achieved its intended goals, which are to eradicate corruption, to have timely feedback, to make recruitment cost effective and maintains transparency. Thus, this study sought to investigate the transformation from manual to e-recruitment in Tanzania public services recruitment secretariat. The study is informed by Kurt Lewins Model of Change, focusing on why e-recruitment was an alternative to the manual recruitment, examining the regulatory frameworks governing e-recruitment, examining e-recruitment implementation strategies and processes and finding out how the management of forces for change may explain the reasons why e-recruitment does not meet the intended objectives.

METHODOLOGY

Study Area

In order to accommodate the insightful and reliable data on e-recruitment transformation process, the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat (PSRS) was an area considered suitable for the conduct of this study. This is due to its mandate to run the recruitment process in public service according to section 29 (1) of the Public Service Act No. 8 of 2002 as amended by Act No. 18 of 2007. Thus, this study was conducted in Public Service Recruitment Secretariat (PSRS) located in Dodoma Tanzania.

Sample Size and Sampling Procedures

Purposive Sampling

Purposive sampling technique was used in collecting data from the Director of the PSRS, PHRO, and PLO. These respondents were purposely selected because the Director and PHRO have detailed information on the administration at the PSRS, the practice of Human Resource as the unit where recruitment is done. Likewise, the ICT Department has concrete data on the use of electronic technology in the recruitment process. The PLO has vest knowledge on legal issues hence provided the study with information on e-recruitment regulatory frameworks. The Recruitment Section has details on the use of e-recruitment in recruitment processes. Therefore, all units of inquiries were the right points of reference for capturing relevant data concerning this study.

Convenience Sampling Technique

The use of convenience sampling technique was reliable to capture data from available, accessible, willing, and determined respondent who formed two FGDs one comprising 6 job applicants and another comprising 5 employees recruited during e-recruitment were conveniently included to form the two separate groups coded FGDs3 and FGDs4.

Data Collection

For generalization of data and the findings, the study on e-recruitment transformation used triangulation method for data collection, whereby based interviews, focused group discussions, and documentary review were employed. First, during data collection in-depth interview was carried out to capture detailed information on the transformation to e-recruitment in the public

service. In this case, participants and the researcher interacted on one in one conversation with the Director of PSRS, the Principal Human Resource Officer, the Principal Legal Officer, the Head of ICT Department, and the Principal Human Resource Officer 2. As the study was not coercive based, the respondents' interest, and willingness to discuss the subject enabled the researcher and the respondents to form positive social relationships. In this respect, the respondents were in a better position to provide inside information on e-recruitment adaption than any was he case with any other person in the organization due to their critical experiences, perceptions, and views.

Secondly, the need to capture similarities and controversies on e-recruitment transformations among the respondents' views and experiences forced this study to involve focused group discussions (FGDs) with people of the same characteristics. The researcher involved nine members from recruitment section who formed two FGDs with five members from MDA's and six members from RALGA's. Other two groups of job seekers, whereby six respondents were job seekers who had to come to the PSRS for interviews and five respondents were employees who were employed using e-recruitment system.

Lastly, for generalization purposes on the actual implementation of e-recruitment, secondary data were obtained from the documentary reviews. The researcher reviewed both published and unpublished documents to investigate the requirement of meeting e-government Act of 2019. The Act mandated public institutions to have their own rules allowing the use of ICT in providing services to people. The researcher reviewed the PSRS rules of operations of 2021 that provides the conditions to undertake recruitment and selection in the public service with the recognition of the e-recruitment usage. In addition, to identify the way e-recruitment was effective as opposed to the traditional recruitment, the review of the PSRS stakeholders' report of 2023 was necessary. This study focused on the use of ICT services as among e-government service, the review of e-government regulations of 2020 and e-government guidelines. . Finally, the researcher visited PSRS website to capture necessarily information on the management of changes in the public services.

Data Analysis

Thematic analysis was used to analyse data captured from interview and FGDs based on themes, the researcher gathered information and match the patterns to build strong descriptions. As a result, data were grouped into themes and analysed accordingly. In order to capture the real feelings of the respondents, the researcher provided quotes from the respondents; data were also categorized and organized into narratives to catch the experience of respondents. Content analysis was used to determine the presence of certain words, themes, and concepts that were used to quantify and analyse the presence, meanings, and relationships of words, themes, and concepts on e-recruitment. Finally, the findings were presented in accordance with the objectives of the study.

Conformability

To ensure the truth-value and accuracy of the study findings, the researcher presented the actual collected data from key informants with no bias. During data collection, the researcher recorded the discussions and interviews for reference.

RESULT AND DISCUSSIONS

The Profile of Public Service Recruitment Secretariat

The Public Service Recruitment Secretariat (PSRS) is a separate department established by the Public Service Act No of 2002, as amended by Act No. 18 of 2007, section 29(1). The PSRS is located in Dodoma region and has many functions as per the Public Service Cap. 298 of 2002, which insisted that the PSRS should prepare a database of professionals with specific skills for easier recruitment. Second PSRS has the obligation of registering professionals and graduates for easy reference to fill the open vacancies. Third, was to obtain information of the qualified experts for conducting interviews. Fourth, providing advice to employers on a variety of recruitment related issues as well as recruiting eligible personnel for ministries, self-governing departments, executive agencies, Regional Secretariats, LGA's and other public service institutions.

The Profile of the Sample

Table 1: Demographics Information

Variable	Category	Frequency (n=25)	Per cent (%)
Gender	Male	16	64
	Female	9	36
Age	20-24	3	12
	25-30	4	16
	31-35	9	36
	36-40	5	20
	Above 40	4	16
	Education level	Diploma certificate	4
	Bachelor degree	16	64
	Master's degree	5	20
Working experience	Less than year	5	20
	1-10 years	12	48
	Above 10 years	8	32

Source: Field Data, (2023)

E-recruitment as an alternative to the Manual Recruitment

In order to reveal the factors of the adoption of e-recruitment in public services, the researcher was guided by Kurt Lewin's Theory of Change in which unfreezing theoretical assumption was used to guide the analysis of the data presented. Therefore, the researcher looked into the initiators of change, and the reasons for change. From the interview, the key informants from the PSRS revealed that, the adoption of e-recruitment in public service was initiated by the e-Government Agency (e-GA). This was established under the execution of the cabinet directives to the President's Office Public Service Management (PO-PSM). As quoted

The e-government Agency initiated the establishment of e-recruitment in public service by demanding all public institution to provide service by the means of ICT (Interview, key informant 15, 23rd March 2023)

The initiators of e-recruitment was the e-Government Agency (eGA) established under the Executive Agencies Act, Cap.245 acting independently to some degree, the agency is charged with the mandate of providing direction, oversight and provision of e-Government initiatives and implementation of e-Government standards to the public institutions (FGD2, 31st March 2023)

Reasons for the Adoption of E-recruitment

E-recruitment was adopted because of the challenges of manual recruitment and the advantages e-recruitment offers in public service as well as global changes in technological advancement. The key informants cited nepotism, delay in decision-making, and high cost of running the recruitment process, the increase of ghost workers, loss of applicants' information and corruption as challenges facing e-recruitment today. Thus is evident in this quote,

We adopted e-recruitment in order to overcome challenges associated by the traditional recruitment such as cost and time wastage, corruption, ghost workers and nepotism. Also the world changes where we have to go abreast with the modern trend for effective recruitment in public service have forced us to go e recruitment (Interview, key informant I5, 23rd March 2023)

Global changes in technology as well as the hardship of using traditional recruitment methods that raised many difficulties forcing the public service recruitment secretariat adopt e-recruitment (FGD2, 31st March 2023)

The PSRS stakeholders Meeting Report of 2023 revealed that stakeholders and budgetary challenges forced the management to think of a new way of working, which was the use of e-recruitment. This was one way of overcoming the challenges associated with traditional recruitment such as corruption, nepotism, delay in decision-making, high cost of running the recruitment process, an increase of ghost workers, and loss of applicants' information due to poor storage of information. The adoption of e-recruitment helps to minimize costs and time spent in recruitment procedures due to the presence of recruitment websites used in announcing job posts and providing feedback to the applicants. , e-recruitment saves cost for the PSRS and employers on the advertisement of job vacancies due to the widespread of information that reaches large population within a short time. In addition, e-recruitment saves time in decision making concerning the preparation of shortlist and long list as the system directly remove people with no required qualifications. Similar findings are reported in a study by Malekano (2022) who revealed that, TANAPA had to reveal challenges in the use of Traditional recruitment. However, the advent of e-recruitment improved the performance of HRM Department. Moreover, the use of e-recruitment created a great pool in job attraction and the possibility of hiring potential candidates; this has been attained due to the enhanced security and proper storage of digital systems and software that are now keeping references for replacement and other job relocation in the public service.

Regulatory Frameworks Governing E-recruitment in the Public Service

Kurt Lewin's theory of Change provides that the organization should have regulations, laws, and policies governing change. According to the findings of the current study, the regulatory frameworks governing e-recruitment are the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat Rules of Operations of 2021, the ICT policy of 2016, e-government guidelines of 2017, e-government Act of 2019 and e-government regulations of 2020. As quoted,

The e-government Act no, 10 of 2019 demands all public institutions to provide services through electronic systems. Also, e-government guidelines of 2017 and e-government regulations no 37 of 2020 require the public institutions to have their own strategies in implementing e-recruitment. But the PSRS rules of operations of 2021 has little show a need to integrate ICT with recruitment

matters so that recruitment in the public service has to align with the modern era (Interview, key informant II, 23rd March 2023).

The reviewed e-government strategy of 2022 as from preliminary page x provided the legal frameworks that facilitate the use of electronic services in Tanzania's public organizations. The e-Government Act of 2019 and e-government Regulations of 2020 were enacted, to allow for the legal provisions on the implementation, management, and operations of e-Government. The e-government regulations of 2020 provide a legal regime for institutions to formulate their regulations and strategies that may or will foster the ICT global change to provide robust services to the Tanzanian people. In addition, the e-government Act of 2019 prohibits the use of paperwork in providing public services.

Table 2: Captured Themes on Regulatory Frameworks in Facilitating E-recruitment

Regulatory framework	Facilitation on adopting e-recruitment
ICT Policy (2003)	Learning and adopting ICT
E-government regulation (2020)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Providing strategies and plans for change • Creating their own regulatory framework governing electronic services
E-government Act (2019)	Reduction of paperwork

Source: Field Data (2023)

This finding implies that the presence of these regulatory frameworks paves a way to integrating recruitment with digital innovations, as the regulatory frameworks provides the procedures and strategies to which public institutions should adhere to create suitable electronic system. The findings are supported by findings in a study by Mtui (2019) who revealed that employees in organizations understand what is expected in their work. This is because the regulatory frameworks provide guidelines for the works through various human resource related systems; thus, employees are responsible for the quality of work they do, staff also have to access the legal frameworks and policies concerning any technological changes. As Same as Lupilya (2017) observes, a well regulatory atmosphere reduces challenges that may hinder the organization from achieving its intended goal.

E-recruitment Implementation Strategies and Processes

Kurt Lewin's Theory of Change, suggests that for an organization to transform there should be strategies and process that are systematically planned so as to facilitate its consistence in adopting change through involving employees and other stakeholders. The findings revealed that PSRS should involve stakeholder and all employees who will be affected by the changes to have systematic strategies and process that help the organization to achieve the intended goals. These are the internal and external stakeholders of the PSRS; the internal stakeholders were the PSRS employees who are in Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation Unit as well as the Administration and Human Resource Division together with the Recruitment Section. The external stakeholders are the Private organizations, High Learning Institutions as well as the PO-PSM. As quoted,

The PSRS involves both internal and external stakeholders in implementing the change, since we cannot make decisions without consulting the stakeholders as they are among the user of the electronic system. The PO-PSM, higher learning institutions, private institutions and the PSRS by considering all public

institutions opinions, involved in the changes that are taking place. (Interview, Key informant I2, 23rd March 2023)

The PSRS Stakeholders Meeting Report of 2023 revealed that the adoption of e-recruitment started back in 2014. This implies that changes are still taking place since the processes of recruiting employees electronically are incomplete in some stages such as conducting interviews electronically through online system for aptitude test, psychometric system, as well as video conference facilities.

E-recruitment Implementation Strategies

The PSRS provides training to the staffs dealing with recruitment and non-recruitment activities continuously, it provides ICT equipment, retains ICT experts, and develops realistic induction programs to the new hires and provides rules that guides the PSRS activities and restricts staffs from receiving the application manually. The following are the strategies as quoted from key informants,

We have been promoting e-recruitment by providing training to staffs, retaining dedicated and hard-working employees with ICT knowledge by giving to them incentives and recognizing their contributions. In addition, we always adhere on developing realistic induction programs for new hires to provide clear understanding of their duties and responsibilities as well as hiring the very best talent in the pool. (Interview, respondent II, 23rd March 2023)

Table 3: Captured Themes on E-recruitment Implementation Strategies

Strategy	Implication
Training	Regular training within and outside the country, coaching and mentoring
Provision of ICT equipment	Computers accessories
Retaining ICT experts	Motivation by providing incentives and recognition of employees' performance
Provision of rules that guides the recruitment activities	The PSRS rules of operation of 2021 to guide all PSRS activities.

Source: Field Data (2023)

E-recruitment Implementation Processes

The implementation of e-recruitment needs advanced technology to work effectively in implementing e-recruitment in public service. The key informants cited the process involved in implementing e-recruitment in public service as including the provision of advanced ICT equipment, integrating PSRS systems with other organizations, creating online recruitment portal, linking employment related information to mobile phones and the use of social Medias. As quoted from one of the key informants,

We have provided advanced ICT equipment to our staffs, we are creating software that enables our system to integrate with other organizations systems in case of verifications of certificates and other applicant's information whereby our system is integrated with NECTA, NIDA also we are in progress of integrating our system with TCU. Job alerts to candidate for wide accessibility has been enhanced since candidates review our social media such as twitter, Facebook and Instagram where the advertisement opened vacancies are done. The presence of online interviews through video conferences whereby

it has started for higher managerial post, the PSRS has managed to conduct online interview through system aptitude test as well as video conference for example the interview conducted in Dar-es-Salaam at TAGLA on due 2023. (Interview, key informant II, 23rd March 2023)

According to The PSRS Stakeholders Meeting Report 2023, the e-recruitment implementation process involves the creation of the recruitment portal and integrating the PSRS systems with other organizations systems such as NIDA, NACTE for verification purposes. Others include the use of social media in advertisement to meet a large population and quick spread of information such as twitter, Instagram, Facebook and YouTube, and providing Bulk SMS that is up to date. Such a system provides short messages for mobile phones and brief information that is understandable and enables help desk operations. Current useful facilities include email and phone numbers, and video conference facilities for running interviews have now started at the management level positions (pg. no 24-32 of PSRS Stakeholders Meeting Report 2023).

Table 4: Captured Themes on E-recruitment Implementation Process

Process	Service
System integration with other government systems i.e. (NIDA, NACTE)	Verification of applicants' information
PSRS website	Providing information concerning the employment activities in PSRS
Recruitment portal	Announcements and advertisement of vacancies, application, short listing and storing the applicants' information
Social medias i.e. (instagram, twitter, facebook)	Advertisement
Bulk SMS	Feedback, and job alerts
Video conference	Online interview
Call centre	Responding to applicants complaints and solving challenges in using the recruitment portal

Source: Field Data (2023)

This implies that Tanzania Government has made a huge achievement in enhancing the use of technological services through obtaining digital devices. Thus, in the recruitment sphere, the government has reduced excessive use of paperwork in recruitment procedures. As observed by Shah *et al* (2020), the provision of web service such as LinkedIn and job search sites has enabled public organizations to use the automated process in publishing positions and receiving applications through e-recruitment. As Ilmia *et al* (2022) argue, digital processes should be implementation whereby companies would employ e-recruitment to support recruitment strategies that will reduce the use of paperwork for efficient recruitment and to protect the work environment.

Management of Forces for Change

From Kurt Lewin's Change Model in refreezing stage provides that, organizations should evaluate their performance and adaption a state of art system to enable systematic changes and to highlight the weakness or challenges encountered in such changes. Public Service Recruitment Secretariat has a specific department that deals with monitoring and evaluation of the performance of the Secretariat known as Planning Monitoring and Evaluation Unit whose function is preparation of periodic performance reports. As quoted,

In PSRS, we have Planning monitoring and evaluation unit with the function of preparing strategic plans, medium term expenses frameworks and annual development plans and budget for the secretariat. We are able to manage change by conducting research and analysing data needed in the formulation and implementation of plans and budgetary proposal that will be used in modifying our electronic systems. Also providing technical support in monitoring and evaluation process within the office, and undertaking service delivery assessments to collect stakeholders' views on e-recruitment in the PSRS by collaborating with other units. (Interview, key informant I2, 21st March 2023)

The PSRS website highlights the functions of the unit dealing with management of changes by providing the functions of y Planning Monitoring and Evaluation Unit in the PSRS, which include

- a) Preparing strategic plans, medium term expenditure frameworks and annual development plans and budget for the secretariat; monitor and evaluate their implementation
- b) Preparing periodic performance reports for development plans of the Recruitment Secretariat;
- c) Providing technical guidance and support for institutionalization of strategic planning and budgeting process within the office;
- d) Studying and analysing statistics needed in the formulation and implementation of plans and budgetary proposals;
- e) Providing technical support including institutionalization of monitoring and evaluation process within the office;
- f) Undertaking research and impact studies of plans, projects and programs undertaken by the secretariat, and undertaking surveys on service delivery to collect stakeholders and clients views on services provided by the office in collaboration with various divisions and units.

This implies that Planning Monitoring and Evaluation Unit does not only deal with changes in e-recruitment but also in the organization as whole. This is done in collaboration with other divisions and units, collecting stakeholders and other clients' views to identify areas for improvements and challenges. the provision of technical support and evaluation of the electronic recruitment performance enables the secretariat to identify weather the new ways of recruitment are satisfactory and being able to know why the implementation of e-recruitment has not met the intended objectives and what should be done to make it more effective and efficient. The findings are supported by the findings in study by Too (2018) who reveals that in order to have permanent changes; there should be following up of the daily activities, by conducting periodic evaluation on the organization performance based on the new implemented changes. The study recommended for having institutional frameworks to making rules and regulations to be adhered to. Institutional frameworks consist of punishments against those who bend the rules, and laws governing the change process, this is for better performance of the new systems.

Challenges Facing E-Recruitment

Since Kurt Lewin Theory of Change requires organizations to evaluate their performance, and for the PSRS to comply with this theory by performing self-evaluation to know the status of the organization and to identify areas for improvements. From the findings the reasons as to why e-recruitment does not meet, the intended objectives were explained by the key informants by citing the challenges hindering the implementation of e-recruitment. Key informants cited applicants' incapability to use the recruitment system, forgery of information, and centralization of recruitment to the public service recruitment secretariat (PSRS) as challenges facing e-recruitment. Others include limited reach, poor internet connectivity, budget constraints and inadequacy of system integration as quoted,

The challenge is that in most cases, there are inadequacy of proper instructions that are issued to the applicants on how to apply and use the system as required which in the long run possess a challenge for candidates who are not well knowledgeable on such electronic recruitment platforms” (Interview, key informant 15, 23rd March 2023)

Fraud applicants has appeared due to inability of the system in terms of automatic verification of applicants certificates since we have been witnessing applicants with forged qualifications being called for the interview this shows that the system do not have security codes to identify forged information. (FGD 4, 31st March 2023)

“The centralization of recruitment process by the government under the PSRS has led to complaints among the employers by saying; PSRS sometimes select candidates they are not looking for in terms of qualifications. Since some of the employees being selected do not, possess enough knowledge to understand the needs of the organization, which leads to gaps and consuming employers' time in training employees (Interview, key informant 15, 23rd March 2023)

Table 5: Captured Themes According to the Respondents' Characteristics

Recruitment Secretariat	Employer	Applicants/ Job seekers
Budget constraints	Centralization of recruitment activities to the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat	Insecurity of the e-recruitment system
Inadequate system integration	Limited Reach	Internet connectivity
Applicants incapability to use the recruitment system	Inadequate system integration	Centralization of recruitment activities to the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat
Internet connectivity		

Source: Field Data (2023)

This implies that inability of using the e-recruitment system by the applicants is caused by poor background in their education, which limits a chance of these people from using the recruitment portal. Insecurity of the system results in forgery of information since the system does not recognize forged certificates. Centralization of recruitment to the PSRS makes the PSRS overloaded with work hence leading to delays in the recruitment process and the possibility of getting unqualified employees. Limited reach is due to the geographical location since some applicants are located in rural areas, which makes it difficult for the applicants to get information concerning new vacancies. Poor internet connectivity also creates challenges to

the applicants; thus, they spend a long time in the internet without achieving their goal; poor network connectivity makes the e-recruitment system unstable, which may result in the loss of information. Budget constraints are due to the expensiveness of the technologies, which are used in implementing e-recruitment, this needs the government to provide more funds for effective and efficient technologies. Inadequate system integration hinders verification of applicants' information thus attracting frauds. Similar findings are reported in a study by Mshanga, (2020) who cited challenges hindering the implementation of e-recruitment as connectivity problems, delay in feedback, political interference, and financial constraints in running and maintaining e-recruitment systems. A Study by Sikawa (2023) underlines the disparities in the e-recruitment access and usage, particularly in developing countries. It highlights factors such as geographical location and limited infrastructure as impeding network access to individuals especially those in the lower social economic group residing in the rural areas. In addition, e-recruitment has led to an increase of duplicate candidates thus minimizing chances for candidates with the right qualifications from being selected and the inability of the e-recruitment system to select candidates based on their behaviours and attitudes. This leads to employers' failure in getting the skills they are looking for.

Conclusion

Tanzania public service has adopted e-recruitment since it is regarded as the best way of recruiting candidates. This is because of the advantages it offers over traditional recruitment such as cost and time effectiveness, attracting large pool of applicants, promoting transparency, flexibility, and maintaining security of applicants' information. The adoption of e-recruitment has been facilitated by the regulatory frameworks such as e-government Act of 2019 and its regulations of 2020 by influencing the use of electronic services in public institutions and obliges them to have their own regulatory frameworks. However, the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat does not have their own regulatory frameworks instead; they have been relying on these e-government Act and Guidelines that are used by all public institutions. Strategies and process used in implementing e-recruitment has enabled the adoption of e-recruitment. However, there are challenges limiting e-recruitment adoption, these include inability to use the recruitment system, infiltration of fraud applicants, centralization of recruitment to the public service recruitment secretariat (PSRS), limited reach, poor internet connectivity, budget constraints, and inadequacy of the system to detect other human variables such as candidates' character and behavioural conduct.

Recommendations

In view of the foregoing observations, the study recommends to the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat to have their own regulatory frameworks that will provide clear guidelines for employees and applicants when utilizing e-recruitment system to fulfil the demand of e-government Regulations of 2020.

In order for e-recruitment process to be complete, the government and other stakeholders may provide material and financial support for the recruitment secretariat to have enough budgets to afford the cost of e-recruitment technologies, hiring more ICT experts for more innovation and stable systems.

Limitation and Further Studies

As the study was centred on the transformation process, employers, PSRS, and job seekers were needed to be part of this study but due to the inconvenience on their availability, few

candidates were included to provide data through FGDs whose number is not representative of the entire population of jobseekers in the country. Thus, this leads to biasness since job seekers might provide more information based on their experience provided they are the main actors and end users of e-recruitment. Thus, further study can be conducted using quantitative or mixed approach focusing on job seekers for inclusion of a large sample for generalizing findings and widening up insights on e-recruitment.

Contribution to the Literature

As there is scarcity of knowledge on e-recruitment transformation process, the study added knowledge in the current literature regarding reasons for shift, the available e-recruitment regulatory frameworks, strategies for implementing e-recruitment and the hindrance of its intended objectives.

REFERENCES

- Abdul-Latif, Mohammed, Frank Boateng, F., & Einezan, B. (2019). Success and relevance of social networking sites (SNS) intergration in E-recruitment : HR personel perspective Ghana. *International Journal of Academic Information Systems Research*, 3(8), 12-19
- Agarwal, R. (2022). A Study on E-recruitment an Exploratory Study. *Sanishodhan*, 11(1), 108-114.
- Agazu, B. G., Birbirsa, Z. A., & Werke, S. Z. (2022). Leadership Models and Change Management: A systematic Review
- AL-Qassem,A. H., Agha, K., Vij, M., Elrehail, H., & Agarwal, R. (2023, March). Leading Talent Management: Empirical investigation on Applicant Traking System (ATS) on e-recruitment Performance. In *2023 international Conference on Business Analytics for Technology and security (ICBATS)*, (pp. 1-5). IEEE.
- Anand, J., & Radha, S. (2020). E-Recruitment: An Advantage Over Traditional Recruitment. *International Journal of Advanced Research in Management, Architecture, Technology and Engineering (IJARMATE)*, 1-15.
- Anduru, A. Rachel, E., & Goril, S . (2021). E-recruitment System for Schools and Hospitals in the Ecclesiastical province of Arusha in Tanzania. *Current Science*, 1(1), 1-11.
- Anna B. H. (2014). Institutional context and e-recruitment practice of Danish Organizations, *Employee Relations*, 36 (4), . 432-455
- Arifuzzaman, M., Islam, M.S., Masum, M. Y., & Annona, J. S. (2023). The use of e-recruitment Process with comparison of Traditional Recruitment Process in Bangladesh: A case Study on BRAC Bank Ltd. *Journal of Education, Management and Development Studies* 3(2), 15-25.
- Baker, P. (2017). The domestic of politics: Women and American Political Society, 1780-1920. *In the Progressive Era in the USA: 1890-1921*(pp.181-208. Routledge.
- Bana, B. (2017). Managing the staffing Function in Public Services: the Tanzanian Experience. *The African Review*, 33(1&2), 85-125
- Bejtkovsky, J., Rozsa, and Hendrati Dwi Mulyaningsih. (2018) “ A phenomenon of digitalization and e-recruitment business environment.” *Polish journal of anagement Studies*, 18(1), 58-68
- Buya, I., & Kambu, A. S. (2020). Influence of E-Recruitment on Public Service Delivery In Tana River County, Kenya.
- Chavuya, K.J. (2021). D58/CTY/PT/21847/2012 (Doctorial Dissertation, Kenyatta University).
- Faton, I., Falesta, O. G., Kristianingrum, D. Y., & Aini, I. (2023). Nursing Management in an Era of Disruption in the Perspective of Kurt Lewin. *Innovative: Journal of Social Science Research*, 3(3), 6735-6741.
- GULTOM, E.S (2021). The pedulilindungi application: an overview of digital society by Kurt Lewin. IX Political and Economic Self-Constitution: Education for Digital Citizenship in Post-Pandemic Times, 51.

- Gusain, A., Singh, T., Pandey, S., Pachourui, V., Singh, R., & Kumar, A. (2023, March). E-Recruitment Using Artificial Intelligence as Preventive Measures. In *2023 International Conference on Sustainable Computing and Data Communication Systems (ICSDS)* (pp. 516-522). IEEE
- Indira, V., & Rathika, S. (2020). A Study On E-Recruitment And Its Present Condition Towards Job Seekers. *International Research Journal of Engineering and Techechnology (IRJET)*, 3752-3758.
- Kaur, D., & Kaur, R. (2023). Does electronic word of mouth influence e-recruitment adoption? A meditation analysis using the PLS-SEM approach . *Management Research Review*, 46(2), 223-224.
- Lufunyo, H. (2013). Impact of public sector reforms on service delivery in Tanzania. *Journal of Public Administration and Policy*, 5(2).
- Lupilya, E. C., & Jung, K. (2015). E-Government transformation in Tanzania: Status, opportunities, and challenges. *Journal of Policy Studies*, 30(1), 147–184.
- Mahamoud, A. (2021). *Impact of Human Capital Management Information System on Organisation Performance in Tanzania* (Doctoral dissertation, The Open University of Tanzania).
- Mahfuz, T. B. (2022). A study on human resource management on BRAC international.
- Malekano, M. (2021). Effectiveness And Efficiency Of E-Recruitment In Public Organizations. *International Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research*, Vol. 9, Issue 4, pp: (197-203).
- Manenji, T. (2019). An Analysis On The Effectiveness Of E-Recruitment In The Telecommunications Sector: A Case Of Econet Wireless Zimbabwe. *academia*, 1-43.
- Mgaiwa, S. J. (2021). Fostering graduate employability: Rethinking Tanzania’s university practices. *SAGE Open*, 11(2), 21582440211006709.
- Mmari, U. (2013). *Efficiency of the public service recruitment process: perception by bachelor of commercee graduate*, Master Thesis. Morogoro: Mzumbe University.
- Mshanga, Z. (2020). *The implementation of e-government in Tanzanian public sector: a case of e-recruitment in the public service recruitment secretariat*. Dodoma: University of Dodoma.
- Mtui, E. F. (2019). Digitalization of the Human Resources Management: *Changes and challenges- A case study of Mwananchi Communication LTD* (Doctorial Dessertation, The open university of Tanzania).
- Mwakasungula, A. N. (2018). *The Impact of E-recruitment on Human Resources Management Comparative Case Study of Central and Local*. Global Public Administration Major.
- Mwasha, N... (2013). An over-view of online recruitment: The case of public and private sectors in Tanzania. *European Journal of Business and Managemen*, 5(32).
- Nair, J., Nair, A. A., & Dixit, A. (2020). The Study Of Virtual Recruitment: The New Normal. *International Journal of Scientific Research in Engineering and Management (IJSREM)*, 2582-3930.

- Nguti, V., & Mose, T. (2021). The Role Of E-Recruitment And Selection Functions On The Organizational Outcomes In HESLB, Kenya. *International Academic Journal of Human Resource and Business Administration*, 2518-2374.
- Nyamwega, H. N. (2012). *Perceptions of Human Resource managers on costs and benefits associated with application of e-recruitment* (Doctorial dissertation, University of Nairobi).
- Okolie, U., & Irabor, I. (2017). E-Recruitment: Practices, Opportunities and Challenges. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 2222-2839.
- Olaniyan, A. H., & Hemlata, S. (2023, February). Evaluating E-recruitment Data Quality in Employee Hiring Process. In *Future of Information and Communication Conference* (pp. 487-499). Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland.
- Rathee, R., & Bhuntel, R. (2017). Benefits, Challenges and Impact of e-Recruitment. *VSRD International Journal of Business and Management Research*, 2319-2194.
- Shah, N., Michael, F., & Chalu, H. (2020). Effects of E-HRM on HR efficiency in private commercial Banks of Tanzania. *Operations research Society of Eastern Africa*, 10(1), 64-93.
- Sikawa, G. Y. (2023). E-recruitment and merit employee selection. An HR paradox. *Journal of Management and Science*, 13(2), 54-58.
- Sultana, S. (2023). Digitalization of E-recruitment system and Organizational Performance of Hishabee Technology Limited.
- Tefurukwa, O. W. (2019). *Online Management of Student Admissions and Loans in Higher Education Institutions in Tanzania* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Dar es Salaam).
- Tefurukwa, O. W. (2021). Managing Ghost Workers Fraud on Payroll in Tanzania: A Conceptual Framework. *International Journal of Governance and Public Policy Analysis*, 3(01).
- The African Union (2019) the African Union Summit 2019, AU-Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- The African Union (2020) the Commission Agenda by the year 2063, AU-Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- The African Union (2020) the Digital Transformation Strategy by the Year 2030, AU- Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- The United Republic of Tanzania (2009) the Public Service Standing Order of 2009 URT-Dodoma
- The United Republic of Tanzania (2017) the Public Service Act of 2003 Revised in 2017 URT-Dodoma
- The United Republic of Tanzania (2019) the e-Government Act No., 10 of 2019, URT-Dodoma
- The United Republic of Tanzania (2021) the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat Rules of Operations of 2021, URT-Dodoma
- The United Republic of Tanzania (2022) the e-Government Regulations No 37 of 2022, URT-Dodoma
- The United Republic of Tanzania (2022) the e-Government Strategy of 2022, URT-Dodoma

- Too, A. (2018). *Effect of organizational culture on change management in county governments in Kenya: A case study of county government of Nakuru*. Kabarak University.
- Zaid, Z. A., & Zia-ud-Din, M. (2023). Protecting Childrens Rights in the Digital World: An Ever- Growing Challenge. *Al-Qantara*, 9(1), 327-343.
- Zwingina, T. C., & Anyiam, U. (2020). Effect Of Recruitment On Productivity In Nigeria National Lottery Regulatory Commision, Abuja.